

# **Exhibit A**

**From:** [ijh@hellerstein-law.com](mailto:ijh@hellerstein-law.com)  
**To:** [Levander, Samuel](#)  
**Cc:** [Rosenthal, Jeffrey A.](#); [Saenz, Andres](#); [Wright, Katerina](#); [Everton, Olivia](#)  
**Subject:** RE: In re Application of Vale S.A. et al., No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW  
**Date:** Wednesday, January 12, 2022 9:09:33 AM

---

Sam:

As I pointed out on my letter to the Judge, Mr. Blackstock is not the right person to testify on behalf of Perfectus. It will be a waste of everyone's time.

The Judge did not include in her order any provisions for remote depositions.

We, therefore, prefer to wait for the Judge's guidance before proceeding.

Please do not threaten my client. You have no authority to hold anyone in contempt. Only the Judge has that authority.

Joe

Joseph Z. Hellerstein  
APM & Co.  
972-52-420-1114  
US 561-367-2569

On Jan 12, 2022 00:39, "Levander, Samuel" <[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com)> wrote:

Joe,

Given your representation that Mr. Blackstock cannot travel to New York, we are willing to conduct the deposition remotely. We need to discuss the logistics and protocol for the remote deposition – we will give you a call to discuss those logistics and a date in the morning.

We would also remind you that unless and until the Court alters its prior ruling, your client is under a Court order to appear for a deposition and will be in contempt should it refuse to do so – we therefore expect your full cooperation so as to ensure timely compliance in the event the Court does not grant your requested relief.

Best regards,

Sam

---

**Samuel Levander**

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
Assistant: [mdigiario@cgsh.com](mailto:mdigiario@cgsh.com)  
One Liberty Plaza, New York NY 10006  
T: +1 212 225 2951  
[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com) | [clearygottlieb.com](http://clearygottlieb.com)

---

**From:** Levander, Samuel  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 11, 2022 12:46 PM  
**To:** 'jzh@hellerstein-law.com' <jzh@hellerstein-law.com>  
**Cc:** Rosenthal, Jeffrey A. <jrosenthal@cgsh.com>; Saenz, Andres <asaenz@cgsh.com>; Wright, Katerina <kawright@cgsh.com>; Everton, Olivia <oevertont@cgsh.com>  
**Subject:** RE: In re Application of Vale S.A. et al., No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW

Joe,

Please update us as soon as possible. Are you available for a call today or tomorrow to discuss logistics?

Best regards,

Sam

---

**Samuel Levander**

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
Assistant: [mdigiario@cgsh.com](mailto:mdigiario@cgsh.com)  
One Liberty Plaza, New York NY 10006  
T: +1 212 225 2951  
[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com) | [clearygottlieb.com](http://clearygottlieb.com)

**From:** [jzh@hellerstein-law.com](mailto:jzh@hellerstein-law.com) <jzh@hellerstein-law.com>  
**Sent:** Sunday, January 9, 2022 3:47 PM  
**To:** Levander, Samuel <[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com)>

**Cc:** Rosenthal, Jeffrey A. <[jrosenthal@cgsh.com](mailto:jrosenthal@cgsh.com)>; Saenz, Andres <[asaenz@cgsh.com](mailto:asaenz@cgsh.com)>; Wright, Katerina <[kawright@cgsh.com](mailto:kawright@cgsh.com)>; Everton, Olivia <[oevertton@cgsh.com](mailto:oevertton@cgsh.com)>

**Subject:** RE: In re Application of Vale S.A. et al., No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW

Sam:

We are in the process of deciding whom to designate as Perfectus's representative to appear at the deposition.

We will update, when we complete our deliberations.

Joe

On Jan 9, 2022 20:13, "Levander, Samuel" <[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com)> wrote:

Joe,

Please let us know as soon as possible what days (if any) your client is unavailable before January 21, 2022.

Best regards,

Sam

\_\_\_\_\_

**Samuel Levander**

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP

Assistant: [mdigiario@cgsh.com](mailto:mdigiario@cgsh.com)

One Liberty Plaza, New York NY 10006

T: +1 212 225 2951

[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com) | [clearygottlieb.com](http://clearygottlieb.com)

**From:** Levander, Samuel <[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 6, 2022 4:45 PM  
**To:** [jzh@hellerstein-law.com](mailto:jzh@hellerstein-law.com)  
**Cc:** Rosenthal, Jeffrey A. <[jrosenthal@cgsh.com](mailto:jrosenthal@cgsh.com)>; Saenz, Andres <[asaenz@cgsh.com](mailto:asaenz@cgsh.com)>; Wright, Katerina <[kawright@cgsh.com](mailto:kawright@cgsh.com)>; Everton, Olivia <[oeverton@cgsh.com](mailto:oeverton@cgsh.com)>  
**Subject:** In re Application of Vale S.A. et al., No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW

Joe,

As you are aware, earlier today Judge Wang ordered that Vale may take a Rule 30(b)(6) deposition of Perfectus by January 21, 2022. Please provide us as soon as possible with: (i) your client's availability for the deposition within that window, and (ii) who Perfectus will designate to testify on its behalf.

Please let us know your availability to meet and confer early next week.

Best regards,

Sam

---

**Samuel Levander**

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
Assistant: [mdigiario@cgsh.com](mailto:mdigiario@cgsh.com)  
One Liberty Plaza, New York NY 10006  
T: +1 212 225 2951  
[slevander@cgsh.com](mailto:slevander@cgsh.com) | [clearygottlieb.com](http://clearygottlieb.com)

This message is being sent from a law firm and may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments without retaining a copy.

Throughout this communication, "Cleary Gottlieb" and the "firm" refer to Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP and its affiliated entities in certain jurisdictions, and the term "offices" includes offices of those affiliated entities. Our external privacy statement is available at:  
<https://www.clearygottlieb.com/footer/privacy-statement>

This message is being sent from a law firm and may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments without retaining a copy.

Throughout this communication, "Cleary Gottlieb" and the "firm" refer to Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP and its affiliated entities in certain jurisdictions, and the term "offices" includes offices of those affiliated entities. Our external privacy statement is available at:

| <https://www.clearygottlieb.com/footer/privacy-statement>